

MINUTES

MICHIGAN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

September 14, 2021
9:30 a.m.

Present: Dr. Michael F. Rice, Chairperson
Dr. Casandra E. Ulbrich, President
Dr. Pamela Pugh, Vice President
Ms. Tiffany Tilley, Secretary (electronic participation in accordance with the Open Meetings Act)
Mr. Tom McMillin, Treasurer
Dr. Judith Pritchett, NASBE Delegate, SBE Legislative Committee
Ms. Ellen Cogen Lipton, SBE Legislative Committee Chairperson (electronic participation in accordance with the Open Meetings Act)
Ms. Nikki Snyder, SBE Legislative Committee
Mr. Jason Strayhorn, SBE Legislative Committee
Ms. Patricia Readinger, representing Governor Gretchen Whitmer, ex officio (via video)

Also Present: Ms. Leah Porter, 2021-2022 Michigan Teacher of the Year

REGULAR MEETING

I. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m.

II. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education add Discussion on State Board of Education Norms to the agenda immediately following Item C, as the last agenda item of the morning.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion to amend.

**Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Aye
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Aye
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Aye
Ulbrich – Aye**

The motion to amend the agenda carried unanimously.

Dr. Pugh said she wants to talk about the executive order and rules put forth by President Biden on September 9, 2021. She said she wants to revisit COVID testing in schools, COVID vaccinations, and mask wearing during the legislative discussion.

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority, as amended.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

**Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Aye
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Aye
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Aye
Ulbrich – Aye**

The motion carried unanimously.

III. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Dr. Rice asked that the members of the State Board of Education be introduced. Mrs. Marilyn Schneider, State Board Executive, introduced the members of the State Board of Education and their cities of residence. In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, Ms. Ellen Lipton and Ms. Tiffany Tilley joined the meeting via electronic means, due to medical conditions.

Dr. Rice introduced Dr. Sue Carnell, Chief Deputy Superintendent, formerly Chief of Staff to the State Superintendent; and Ms. Rané Garcia, Director of the Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, formerly Superintendent of Muskegon Heights Public School Academy System.

Dr. Rice provided instructions for public participation, which will be held immediately following lunch.

IV. RECESS

The Board recessed the Regular Meeting at 9:41 a.m. and convened the Committee of the Whole.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING

V. CALL TO ORDER

Dr. Rice called the Committee of the Whole Meeting to order at 9:42 a.m.

VI. EDUCATIONAL UPDATES RELATED TO COVID-19

Dr. Rice shared information on COVID-19 cases and vaccination rates, COVID-19 mitigation strategies, mask mandates in counties and school districts, and reasons to be optimistic about increased awareness and willingness to address challenges in schools.

Discussion followed.

VII. PRESENTATION ON ASSESSMENT AND ACCOUNTABILITY

Dr. Delsa Chapman, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports; Mr. Andrew Middlestead, Director, Educational Assessment and Accountability; and Dr. Katharine Strunk, Co-Director, Education Policy Innovation Collaborative (EPIC), Michigan State University; presented on Assessment and Accountability.

Dr. Rice said the presentation provides an update on the results of the 2020-2021 state summative assessments as well as a summary of the findings included in both the benchmark assessment report and Read By Grade 3 Report created in collaboration with the Education Policy Innovation Collaborative (EPIC) at Michigan State University.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included Read By Grade Three retention data, good cause exemptions for Read By Grade Three, lessons learned related to English language arts online instruction, varying definitions of growth and proficiency, clarification of testing period, validity and reliability issues while testing during a pandemic, funding associated with testing and other areas of spending, and voluntary benchmark assessments.

VIII. PRESENTATION ON EDUCATOR WORKFORCE DATA REPORT

Dr. Delsa Chapman, Deputy Superintendent of Educator, Student, and School Supports, and Ms. Leah Breen, Director, Office of Educator Excellence, presented the Educator Workforce Data Report.

Dr. Rice said the informational presentation is the annual update of educator workforce data.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Board member comments included outreach to people with teaching certificates who are not employed as teachers, outreach to people who have not yet passed the test, daily permits and full-year permits, reasons for closure of educator preparation programs, reasons for increase in the number of alternative route candidates, survey questions used to measure meeting student needs, and clarification of payment status and follow up.

IX. DISCUSSION ON MICHIGAN'S STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION BOARD NORMS

Dr. Rice said the Discussion on Michigan's State Board of Education Board Norms was added to the agenda at the beginning of the meeting.

Dr. Ulbrich led the discussion. She acknowledged Dr. Pritchett and Ms. Tilley who worked with Dr. Ulbrich to develop Michigan's State Board of Education Board Norms, and she distributed and read the document. She thanked board members for their input.

Discussion followed.

X. ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned the Committee of the Whole at 12:28 p.m. and reconvened the Regular Meeting at 1:15 p.m.

REGULAR MEETING

XI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

The following people offered public comment.

Physically present at meeting:

1. Connie Robinson, Fenton, Michigan, comments on critical race theory
2. Marcy L. Jankovich, representing Jackson Patriots, Jackson, Michigan, comments on critical race theory
3. Ilona Rugg, Highland, Michigan, comments on public schools and what is being taught
4. Holly Spalding, Jacob Spalding, Miles Spalding, from Milford, Michigan, comments on masks and vaccinations
5. Julia Barker, Howell Chair of Moms for Liberty, Howell, Michigan, comments on critical race theory and COVID

Comments provided virtually:

6. Anna Pennala, Brighton, Michigan, comments on parental choice and critical race theory
7. Nicole Cullers, Livingston County, Michigan, comments on critical race theory
8. Christina Schuetz, Clarkston, Michigan, comments on masks
9. Jennifer Tuksal, Rochester Hills, Michigan, comments on masks, diversity, equity, and inclusion
10. Joellen Pisarczyk, Howell, Michigan, comments on critical race theory
11. Jennifer Smith, representing Moms for Liberty, Livingston County, Michigan, comments on critical race theory and public comment process
12. Sheila Cohoon, Clinton Township, Michigan, comments on masks
13. Brittnee Senecal, Jackson, Michigan, comments on masks
14. Desiree Dragin, White Lake, Michigan, comments on masks
15. Keri Zhao Dean, Oakland County, Michigan, comments on masks

16. Tom Banks, Petoskey, Michigan, comments on COVID antibodies and vaccinations
17. Stacy Roeser, Traverse City, Michigan, comments on COVID, masks, critical race theory, and pronouns
18. Joel Ruhlman, Macomb, Michigan, comments on masks

XII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES

Approval of Minutes of Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of August 10, 2021

Dr. Ulbrich moved, seconded by Mr. Strayhorn, that the State Board of Education approve the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of August 10, 2021.

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Ms. Snyder, that the Minutes of the Regular and Committee of the Whole Meeting of August 10, 2021, be amended to say after the 70th public comment there was a large number of people waiting to be heard.

Discussion followed.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion to amend.

**Lipton – Nay
McMillin – Aye
Pritchett – Nay
Pugh – Nay
Snyder – Aye
Strayhorn – Nay
Tilley – Nay
Ulbrich – Nay**

The motion failed.

Dr. Pugh asked that the motion, that received no second, attributed to her on page two of the August 10, 2021, meeting minutes be deleted since she was asking for guidance rather than making a motion. The request that the motion be deleted was accepted as a friendly amendment.

A roll call vote was taken on the base motion, including the friendly amendment.

**Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Nay
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Nay
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Aye
Ulbrich – Aye**

The motion carried.

Ms. Tilley left the meeting at 2:28 p.m.

XIII. REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

Dr. Ulbrich said Ms. Michelle Fecteau, former State Board of Education Secretary, will receive a Distinguished Service award from the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) during its annual conference October 6-8, 2021.

Dr. Ulbrich asked board members to notify Mrs. Schneider if they would like to participate in the NASBE conference, which will be convened virtually.

XIV. REPORT OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT

Report

H. Human Resources Report

Grants

I. Report on Grant Awards

1. 2020-2021 Diversity and Equity in the Education Workforce – Initial; \$65,000 (Educator Excellence – Leah Breen)
2. 2019-2020 Section 21h: Partnership District Grant – Initial; \$23,311 (Partnership Districts – Gloria Chapman)
3. 2019-2020 Charter School Program Grant – Continuation; \$2,363,763 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
4. 2019-2020 Title I, Part A, Improving Basic Programs – Amendment; \$428,904,930 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
5. 2019-2020 Title II, Part A, Supporting Effective Instruction – Amendment; \$66,376,450 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
6. 2019-2020 Title IV, Part A, Student Support and Academic Enrichment Grant – Amendment; \$32,492,346 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
7. 2020-2021 ISD Collaboration Grant – Amendment; \$777,500 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
8. 2021-2022 Title I, Part C Migratory Education (Regular School Year) – Initial; \$1,753,735 (Educational Supports – Paula Daniels)
9. 2018-2019 Flint Declaration of Emergency – Initial; \$231,744 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
10. 2019-2020 Best Food Forward (BFF) – Initial; \$183,375 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
11. 2019-2020 Flint Declaration of Emergency – Backpack Program – Initial; \$225,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
12. 2019-2020 Project Unify – Initial; \$500,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)

13. 2020-2021 District-Wide Social and Emotional Learning Pilot – Initial; \$38,000 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
14. 2020-2021 Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Program (FFVP) – Amendment; \$4,847,945 (Health and Nutrition Services – Diane Golzynski)
15. 2019-2020 Early On – Governor’s Emergency Education Relief Funds – Initial; \$1,000,000 (Early Childhood Development & Family Education – Noel Kelty)
16. 2020-2021 Great Start Readiness Program Evaluation Grant – Amendment; Continuation; \$128,639 (Preschool & Out-Of-School Time Learning – Richard Lower)
17. 2021-2022 21st Century Community Learning Centers Grants Program – Initial; Continuation; \$33,920,000 (Preschool & Out-Of-School Time Learning – Richard Lower)
18. 2020-2021 Elementary and Secondary School Emergency Relief Fund II (ESSER II) – Amendment; \$1,490,677,457 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)
19. 2020-2021 Governor’s Emergency Education Relief Fund – Amendment; \$62,532,673 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)
20. 2020-2021 Governor’s Emergency Education Relief Fund – Amendment; \$63,032,673 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)
21. 2020-2021 Governor’s Emergency Education Relief Fund – Amendment; \$64,432,673 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)
22. 2020-2021 Governor’s Emergency Education Relief Fund – Initial; \$60,032,673 (Financial Management – Ann Richmond)

Dr. Rice said he joins Dr. Ulbrich in congratulating Ms. Fecteau on being honored with a NASBE Distinguished Service Award.

XV. REPORT OF THE TEACHER OF THE YEAR

Dr. Rice introduced Ms. Leah Porter, 2021-2022 Michigan Teacher of the Year, who presented the Report of the Teacher of the Year. He said Ms. Porter is a third-grade teacher at Wilcox Elementary School in Holt Public Schools.

Ms. Porter introduced Ms. Heather French, Region 1 Teacher of the Year, from Lake Linden-Hubbell Schools in Michigan’s upper peninsula, who joined the meeting via virtual technology. Ms. French teaches art to students in Young 5s through 12th grade, and English language arts to students in 7th grade through 10th grade.

Information was shared via [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Ms. Snyder left the meeting at 2:52 p.m. and rejoined via telephone.

XVI. APPROVAL OF MICHIGAN OUT-OF-SCHOOL TIME STANDARDS OF QUALITY

Dr. Scott Koenigsknecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions, and Mr. Richard Lower, Director, Preschool and Out-of-School Time Learning, presented Approval of Michigan Out-of-School Time Standards of Quality.

Dr. Rice said the Michigan Out-of-School Time Standards of Quality were presented to the State Board of Education on June 8, 2021, and followed by a period of public comment through July 9, 2021. He said the standards were presented to the board on August 10, 2021, and revisions have been made based on board member comments. He said these standards would replace the standards approved by the board in 2013. He said the board is being asked to approve the standards today. He said pending board approval, technical assistance will be provided to the before-, after-, out-of-school time, and summer learning fields by the Office of Preschool and Out-of-School Time Learning to support programming to align with the new standards.

Information was shared via a [PowerPoint presentation](#).

Dr. Pritchett moved, seconded by Dr. Pugh, that the State Board of Education approve the Michigan Out-of-School Time Standards of Quality, as presented in the Superintendent’s memorandum dated August 31, 2021.

Mr. McMillin said he was opposed to the standards last month, and he still has issues with the intrusive nature of social emotional learning and using the Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (CASEL) as a resource.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

**Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Nay
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Absent
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Absent
Ulbrich – Aye**

The motion carried.

XVII. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING SCHEDULE FOR 2022

Dr. Rice said the State Board Executive has proposed a meeting schedule for 2022. He said the regular meetings are scheduled for the second Tuesday of each month, except the November meeting is the third Tuesday to avoid election day. He said the board’s work session is scheduled for the third Tuesday in May. Dr. Rice said the board is being asked to approve the 2022 State Board of Education Meeting Schedule today.

Mr. McMillin moved, seconded by Dr. Pugh, that the State Board of Education approve the State Board of Education Meeting Schedule for Calendar Year 2022, as attached to the State Board Executive’s memorandum dated August 31, 2021.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Aye
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Absent
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Absent
Ulbrich – Aye

The motion carried.

The State Board of Education Meeting Schedule for Calendar Year 2022 is attached as Exhibit A.

XVIII. APPROVAL OF CAMP TUHSMEHETA SPENDING PLAN FOR FISCAL YEAR 2021-2022

Dr. Scott Koenigs knecht, Deputy Superintendent, P-20 System and Student Transitions; Ms. Roxanne Balfour, Director, Low Incidence Outreach, Office of Special Education; Ms. Jill Teegardin, Director, Camp Tuhsmeheeta; and Ms. Michelle Woolf, Financial Manager, Low Incidence Outreach; presented Approval of Camp Tuhsmeheeta Spending Plan for Fiscal Year 2021-2022.

Dr. Rice said the Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee met on August 26, 2021. He said Ms. Nikki Snyder represents the board on the trust fund committee. He said the committee reviewed the Camp Tuhsmeheeta spending plan for fiscal year 2021-2022, and the board is being asked to approve the spending plan during today's meeting.

Ms. Snyder, joining by telephone, said she supports the spending plan.

The 2021 Annual Report for Camp Tuhsmeheeta and budget were distributed and reviewed by staff.

Dr. Pugh moved, seconded by Dr. Pritchett, that the State Board of Education approve the spending plan for Camp Tuhsmeheeta for fiscal year 2021-2022, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated August 31, 2021.

Mr. McMillin asked clarifying questions regarding the budget, staff costs, and if costs are consistent whether virtual or in-person. He asked if children who use the camp would be required to be vaccinated, and who would make that decision. Dr. Rice said vaccinations are under the authority of the state and local health departments.

Dr. Pugh asked for clarification on masking. Ms. Balfour said it is based on children's camping regulations, and the camps are predominantly outdoors. Dr. Pugh asked if the water and ventilation systems are checked, and she encouraged the use of resources available from the Michigan Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Abstain
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Absent
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Absent
Ulbrich – Aye

The motion carried.

XIX. STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Mr. Martin Ackley, Director, Public and Governmental Affairs; Ms. Ellen Cogen Lipton, Chairperson, State Board of Education Legislative Committee; and Dr. Judith Pritchett, NASBE Delegate; presented the State and Federal Legislative Update.

Mr. Ackley provided a report on legislative activity and the budget.

Ms. Lipton said the State Board of Education Legislative Committee met on August 26, 2021, and she provided an update.

Discussion followed.

Dr. Pritchett said information was provided to the board in preparation for the NASBE annual meeting October 6-8, 2021. Dr. Pritchett said she plans to attend the conference, and is willing to serve as the voting delegate if the board agrees.

Dr. Pritchett moved, seconded by Dr. Pugh, that the State Board of Education approve the NASBE Public Education Positions, Amendments to NASBE Bylaws, and designation of Dr. Pritchett as the NASBE Voting Delegate for Michigan, as described in NASBE Delegate’s memorandum dated August 31, 2021.

Mr. McMillin said he has questions regarding the public education positions. Dr. Pritchett said public education positions are a reference guide that state boards of education may or may not choose to use.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion.

Lipton – Aye
McMillin – Nay
Pritchett – Aye
Pugh – Aye
Snyder – Absent
Strayhorn – Aye
Tilley – Absent
Ulbrich – Aye

The motion carried.

XX. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

Mr. McMillin said he has heard about letters from health departments regarding quarantining, and he is concerned. He said he is also concerned about disparaging comments during the board meeting.

Dr. Ulbrich said there is an article in today's edition of the Washington Post referencing National Heritage Academies, and she asked department staff to review it. She said if there are concerns, they should be addressed.

Dr. Pugh said she is disappointed there is no statewide mandate for masks by using an emergency epidemic order. She said she wrote a letter to the governor, and today she received a response from the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services. She said she appreciates the response, and she will review it.

XXI. FUTURE MEETING DATES

- A. Tuesday, October 12, 2021 Regular Meeting at 9:30 a.m.
- B. Tuesday, November 9, 2021 Regular Meeting at 9:30 a.m.
- C. Tuesday, December 14, 2021 Regular Meeting at 9:30 a.m.

XXII. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

Dr. Rice asked Board members if there were additional agenda topics they would like to be considered for future meeting agendas. He said they may contact Mrs. Schneider or himself to offer topics.

XXIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:16 p.m.

The video archive of the meeting is available on Michigan's State Board of Education website (www.michigan.gov/sbe).

Respectfully submitted,

Tiffany Tilley
Secretary

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
MEETING SCHEDULE**

CALENDAR YEAR 2022

January 11, 2022

Second Tuesday

February 8, 2022

Second Tuesday

March 8, 2022

Second Tuesday

April 12, 2022

Second Tuesday

May 10, 2022

Second Tuesday

May 17, 2022 (Work Session)

Third Tuesday

June 14, 2022

Second Tuesday

August 9, 2022

Second Tuesday

September 13, 2022

Second Tuesday

October 11, 2022

Second Tuesday

November 15, 2022

Third Tuesday

December 13, 2022

Second Tuesday

Adopted September 14, 2021